

MN 37 The Shorter Discourse on the Destruction of Craving  
Cūḷataṇhāsankhaya Sutta

And

MN 38: The Greater Discourse on the Destruction of Craving  
Mahātanhāsankhaya Sutta

And

Samyutta Nikāya - Part II: The Book of Causation (Nidānavagga)  
Chapter I – 12 Nidānasamyutta – Connected Discourses on  
Causation

2 (2) Analysis of Dependent Origination

Dhamma Talk presented by Bhante Vimalaramsi  
11-October-05

SK: Cūḷataṇhāsankhaya Sutta

MN 37

The Shorter Discourse on the Destruction of Craving

October 11th

Dhamma Sukha Meditation Center

BV: This is a rather interesting sutta because it's focusing on the Third Noble Truth, The Destruction of Craving. And, it goes into quite deep and heavy detail. I think you'll enjoy this one.

This is Sutta #37 in the Majjhima Nikāya.

Thus have I heard...Dogs are gonna go outside if they continue!

MN 37: Cūḷataṇhāsankhaya Sutta - The Shorter Discourse on the  
Destruction of Craving

1. Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvathī in the Eastern Park, in the palace of Migara's Mother.

BV: You've heard of Visakha. She was the foremost woman supporter of the Buddha and the Sangha. Her father-in-law was Migara. She

impressed him so much that she said that...he said that he would take her as his mother. So, that's...it's just kind of a little "in" joke calling it "Migara's Mother's palace".

MN 37:

2. Then Sakka, ruler of gods, went to the Blessed One, after paying homage to him, he sat down at one side and asked: "Venerable sir, how in brief is a monk liberated in the destruction of craving, one who has reached the ultimate end, the ultimate security from bondage, the ultimate holy life, the ultimate goal, one who is foremost among gods and humans?"

3. "Here, ruler of gods, a monk has heard that nothing is worth adhering to. When a monk has heard that nothing is worth adhering to, he directly knows everything; having directly known everything, he understands everything; having understood everything, whatever feeling he feels, whether pleasant or painful or neither painful nor pleasant, he abides contemplating impermanence on those feelings, contemplating fading away, contemplating cessation, contemplating relinquishment. Contemplating thus, he does not cling to anything in the world. When he does not cling, he is not agitated, when he is not agitated he personally attains Nibbana.

BV: Now, what does that mean that he doesn't cling to anything in the world? He sees everything as Anatta. He sees everything as impermanent. He sees everything as a form of suffering and it's not real. It's just there. Now, this is an interesting thing because any time there is clinging there is an agitation. There's tightness. There's a clinging to views. There's all kinds of concepts and ideas that are wrapped around what's happening and that causes agitation. It causes anxiety. It causes all kinds of slight movements of mind. But, when there is no agitation then Nibbana arises by itself.

{5:06}

MN 37:

He understands: 'Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, what

had to be done has been done, there is no more coming to any state of being.' Briefly, it is in this way, ruler of the gods, that a monk is liberated from the destruction of craving, one who has reached the ultimate end, the ultimate security from bondage, the ultimate holy life, the ultimate goal, one who is foremost among gods and humans.

4. Then Sakka, ruler of gods, delighting and rejoicing in the Blessed One's words, paid homage to the Blessed One, and keeping him on his right, he vanished at once.

5. Now on that occasion the venerable Maha Moggallāna was sitting not far from the Blessed One. Then he considered: "Did that spirit penetrate to the meaning of the Blessed One's words when he rejoiced, or did he not? Suppose I found out whether he did or not."

6. Then, just as quickly as a strong man might extend his flexed arm or flex his extended arm, the venerable Maha Moggallāna vanished from the Palace of Migara's Mother in the Eastern Park and appeared among the gods of the Thirty-three.

Now on that occasion Sakka, ruler of gods, was furnished and endowed a hundredfold of the five kinds of heavenly music, and he was enjoying the Pleasure Park of the Single Lotus. When he saw the venerable Maha Moggallāna coming in the distance, he dismissed the music, went to the venerable Maha Moggallāna, and said to him: "Come, good sir Moggallāna! Welcome, good sir Moggallāna! It is long time sir Moggallāna, since you found an opportunity to come here. Sit down, good sir Moggallāna; this seat is ready."

The venerable Maha Moggallāna sat down on the seat made ready, and Sakka took a low seat and sat down at one side. The venerable Maha Moggallāna then asked him:

8. "Kosiya,

BV: That was his name.

MN 37:

how did the Blessed One state to you in brief deliverance in the destruction of craving? It would be good if we could also get to hear that statement.”

“Good sir Moggallāna, we are so busy, we have so much to do, not only with our own business, but also with the business of the gods of the Thirty-three. Besides, good sir Moggallāna, what was well heard, well learned, and well attended to, well remembered, suddenly vanished from us.

BV: You get up into the heavens, it’s such a pleasurable place, it’s hard to keep your attention on what you’ve already learned.

MN 37:

Good sir Moggallāna, it once happened that the war broke out between the gods and the titans. In that war the gods won and the titans were defeated. But I had won that war and returned from it as a conqueror, I had the Vejayanta Palace built. Good sir Moggallāna, the Vejayanta Palace has a hundred towers, and each tower has seven hundred upper chambers, and each upper chamber has seven nymphs

BV: Play time.

MN 37:

and each nymph has seven maids. Would you like to see the loveliness of the Vejayanta Palace?” The venerable Maha Moggallāna consented in silence.

BV: That means he shook his head okay.

{09:43}

MN 37:

9. Then Sakka, ruler of gods, the divine King of Vessavana went to the Vejayanta Palace, giving precedence to the venerable Maha Moggallāna. When the maids of Sakka saw the venerable Maha Moggallāna coming in the distance, they were embarrassed and

ashamed and they went each to their own rooms. Just as a daughter-in-law is embarrassed and ashamed on seeing her father-in-law, so too, when the maids of the Sakka saw the venerable Maha Moggallāna coming, they were embarrassed and ashamed, and they went into their own rooms.

10. Then Sakka, ruler of gods, the divine King Vessavana had the venerable Maha Moggallāna walk all over and explore this palace: "See, good sir Maha Moggallāna, this loveliness is the Vejayanta Palace! See, good sir Moggallāna, this loveliness of the palace!"

"It does the venerable Kosiya credit to one who has formerly made merit; whenever human beings see anything lovely, they say: 'Sirs, it does credit to the gods of the Thirty-three!' It does the venerable Kosiya credit as one who has formerly made merit."

11. Then Maha Moggallāna considered thus: "This spirit is living much too negligently. What if I stirred up a sense of urgency in him?" When the venerable Maha Moggallāna performed such a feat of supernatural power that with the point of his toe he made the palace shake and quake and tremble. Sakka, the Divine King and the gods of the Thirty-three were filled with wonder and amazement, and they said: "Sirs, it is wonderful, it is marvelous, what power, what might the recluse has, that with the point of his toe he makes the heavenly region shake and quake and tremble!"

12. Then the venerable Maha Moggallāna knew that Sakka, ruler of gods, was stirred to a sense of urgency with his hair standing on end, he asked him: "Kosiya, how did the Blessed One state to you in brief deliverance in the destruction of craving? It would be good if we might also get to hear that statement."

"Good sir Moggallāna, I went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage to him, I stood at one side and said: 'Venerable sir, how in brief is a monk liberated in the destruction of craving, one who has reached the ultimate end, the ultimate security from bondage, the

ultimate holy life, the ultimate goal, one who is foremost among gods and humans?’

{.....skips.....}

That is how the Blessed One stated to me in brief deliverance in the destruction of the craving, good sir Moggallāna.”

13. When the venerable Maha Moggallāna delighted and rejoiced in the words of Sakka, ruler of gods. Then just as quickly as a strong man might extend his flexed arm or flex his extended arm, he vanished from among the gods of the thirty-three and appeared in the Eastern Park in the Palace of Migara’s Mother.

14. Then, soon after the venerable Maha Moggallāna had gone, the attendants of Sakka, ruler of gods, asked him: “Good sir, was that your teacher, the Blessed One?” - “No, good sirs, that was not my teacher, the Blessed One. That was one of his companions in the holy life, the venerable Maha Moggallāna.” - “Good sir, it is a gain for you that your companion in the holy life is so powerful and mighty. Oh, how much more so is the Blessed One, your teacher!”

15. Then the venerable Maha Moggallāna went to the Blessed One, after paying homage to him, sat down at one side and asked him: “Venerable sir, does the Blessed One recall stating in brief - to a certain one of the renowned spirits with a great following - deliverance in the destruction of craving?”

“I do recall doing so, Moggallāna. Here Sakka, ruler of gods, came to me, and after paying homage to him, he stood at one side and asked: ‘Venerable sir, how in brief is a monk liberated in the destruction of craving, one who has reached the ultimate end, the ultimate security from bondage, the ultimate holy life, the ultimate goal, one who is foremost among gods and humans?’ When this was said, I told him: ‘Here, ruler of gods, a monk has heard that nothing is worth adhering to. When a monk has heard that nothing is worth adhering to, he directly knows everything; having directly known everything he fully understands everything, having fully understood

everything, whatever feeling he feels, whether pleasant or painful or neither painful or pleasant, he abides contemplating impermanence in those feelings, contemplating fading away, contemplating cessation, contemplating relinquishment.

{16:59}

BV: If I was writing this sutta I would've put "contemplating relinquishment" right after "contemplating impermanence of those feelings". That's just a personal preference because everything else is about the fading away and cessation and that's...relinquishment means "letting go". So, I would probably have changed that a little bit, but that's just my personal taste.

MN 37:

Contemplating thus, he does not cling to anything in the world. When he does not cling, he is not agitated. When he is not agitated, he personally attains Nibbana.

BV: This is why restlessness is one of the last fetters to let go of; something that's gonna stick around a long time.

MN 37:

He understands: 'Birth is destroyed, the holy life has been lived, what had to be done has been done, there is no more coming to any state of being.' Briefly, it is in this way, ruler of gods, that a monk is liberated in the destruction of craving...who is foremost among gods and humans.' That is how I recall stating in brief to Sakka, ruler of gods, deliverance in the destruction of craving."

That is what the Blessed One said. {.....}

BV: Now, we're gonna keep going on to this with Sutta #38, because that's the big discourse on the Destruction of Craving.

MN 38: Mahātanhāsankhaya Sutta - The Greater Discourse on the Destruction of Craving

1. Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Sāvathī in Jeta's Grove, Anathapindika's Park.

2. Now on that occasion a pernicious view had arisen in a monk named Sāti, son of a fisherman: "As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that runs and wanders through the rounds of rebirths, not another."

BV: That's a view of Eternalism and that was the current Brahmin idea of the day.

{20:01)

MN 38:

3. Several monks, having heard this, went to the monk Sāti and asked him: "Friend Sāti, is it true that such a pernicious view has arisen in you?"

"Exactly so, friends. As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that runs and wanders through the rounds of rebirths, not another."

Those monks, desiring to detach him from that pernicious view, pressed and questioned and cross-questioned him thus: "Friend Sāti, do not say so. Do not misrepresent the Blessed One; it is not good to misrepresent the Blessed One. The Blessed One would not speak thus. For in many ways the Blessed One has stated consciousness to be dependently arisen, since without a condition there is no origination of consciousness."

Yet although pressed and questioned and cross-questioned by those monks in this way, the bhikkhu Sāti, son of a fisherman, still obstinately adhered to that pernicious view and continued to insist upon it.

4. Since the monks were unable to detach him from that pernicious view, they went to the Blessed One, after paying homage to him,

they sat down at one side and told him all that had occurred, adding: "Venerable sir, since we could not detach the monk Sāti, son of a fisherman, from this pernicious view, we have reported this matter to the Blessed One."

5. Then the Blessed One addressed a certain monk thus: "Come, monk, tell the monk Sāti, son of a fisherman, in my name that the Teacher calls him." - "Yes, venerable sir," he replied, and he went to the monk Sāti and told him: "The Teacher calls you, friend Sāti."

"Yes, friend," he replied, and he went to the Blessed One, after paying homage to him, sat down at one side. The Blessed One then asked him: "Sāti, is it true that the following pernicious view has arisen in you:

BV: It's like saying, "Is it true that you're really a fool?" [laughs] That's what that question is, like it's asking, "Don't you think you're really stupid for asking this?" [laughs]

MN 38:

'As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is this same consciousness that runs and wanders through the rounds of rebirths, not another?'

"Exactly so, venerable sir. As I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One, it is the same consciousness that runs and wanders through the rounds of rebirths, not another."

"What is that consciousness, Sāti?"

"Venerable sir, it is that which speaks and feels and experiences here and there the results of good and bad actions."

"Misguided man, to whom have you ever known me to teach the Dhamma in that way? Misguided man, have I not stated in many ways consciousness is dependently arisen, since without a condition there is no origination of consciousness? But you, misguided man,

have misrepresented us by your wrong grasp and injured yourself and stored up much demerit; for this will lead to your harm and suffering for a long time.”

6. Then the Blessed One addressed the monks thus: “Monks, what do you think? Has this monk Sāti, son of a fisherman, kindled even a spark of wisdom in this Dhamma and Discipline?”

“How could he, venerable sir? No, venerable sir.”

When this was said, the Monk Sāti, son of a fisherman, sat silent, dismayed, with his shoulders drooping and head down, glum, and without response. Then, knowing this, the Blessed One told him: “Misguided man, you will be recognized for your own pernicious view. I shall question the monks on this matter.”

{25:27}

BV: He’s still remembered to this day because of that wrong view, 2500 years later.

MN 38:

7. When the Blessed One addressed the monks thus: “Monks, do you understand the Dhamma taught by me as this monk Sāti, son of a fisherman, does when he misrepresents us in his wrong grasp and injures himself and stores up much demerit?”

BV: “Me? I’m not! No! No!”

MN 38:

“No, venerable sir. For in many discourses the Blessed One has stated consciousness to be dependently arisen, since without a condition there is no origination of consciousness.”

“Good, monks. It is good that you understand the Dhamma taught by me thus. For in many ways I have stated consciousness to be dependently arisen, since without a condition there is no origination of consciousness. But this monk Sāti, son of a fisherman,

misrepresents us by his wrong grasp and injures himself and stores up much demerit; for this will lead to the harm and suffering of this misguided man for a long time.

BV: Sāti, son of the fisherman, right after that, disrobed. And, he started talking very negatively about the Buddha and that did cause him to be reborn in a hell realm.

MN 38:  
(Conditionality of Consciousness)

8. "Monks, consciousness is reckoned by the particular condition dependent upon which it arises.

BV: We'll explain that in a minute but I wanna say it again.

[repeats] [...consciousness is reckoned by the particular condition dependent upon which it arises.]

(27:45}

MN 38:  
When consciousness arises dependent on the eye and forms, it is reckoned as eye-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on the ear and sounds, it is reckoned as ear-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on the nose and odors, it is reckoned as nose-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on the tongue and flavor, it is reckoned as tongue-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on body and tangibles, it is reckoned as body consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on mind and mind-objects, it is reckoned as mind-consciousness.

Just as fire is reckoned by the particular condition dependent on which it burns - when a fire burns dependent on logs, it is reckoned as a log fire; when fire burns dependent on faggots, it is reckoned as a faggot fire; when fire burns dependent on grass, it is reckoned as a grass fire; when fire burns dependent on cow-dung, it is reckoned as

a cow-dung fire; when fire burns dependent on chaff, it is reckoned as a chaff fire; when fire burns dependent on rubbish, it is reckoned as a rubbish fire - so too, consciousness is reckoned by that particular condition dependent on which it arises.

When consciousness arises dependent on the eye and forms, it is reckoned as eye-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on ear and sounds, it is reckoned as ear-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on nose and odors, it is reckoned as nose-consciousness; When consciousness arises dependent on the tongue and flavors, it is reckoned as tongue-consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent on body and tangibles, it is reckoned as body consciousness; when consciousness arises dependent upon the mind and mind-objects, it is reckoned as mind-consciousness.

(General Questionnaire on Being)

9. "Monks, do you see: 'This has come to be'?" - "Yes venerable sir."  
- "Monks, do you see: 'Its origination occurs with that as nutriment'?"

{31:04}

BV: What is nutriment?

ST: Can you say that one more time?

BV: Okay.

[repeats] ["Monks, do you see: 'Its origination occurs with that as nutriment'?"]

BV: The eye consciousness. What's the nutriment for eye consciousness?

ST: ~~

BV: Color and form.

ST: Color and form.

MN 38:

"Yes, venerable sir."

BV: But, there's also more to nutriment than that. It has contact with it, too...things like that.

MN 38:

"Monks, do you see: 'With the cessation of that nutriment, what has come to be is subject to cessation'?"

BV: When the light, color, and form stop happening is there eye consciousness? Can't be...because that nutriment has been taken away.

MN 38:

10. "Monks, does doubt arise when one is uncertain thus: 'Has this come to be?'" - "Yes, venerable sir."- "Monks, does doubt arise when one is uncertain thus: 'Does its origination occur with that as nutriment?'"

BV: When you're uncertain of course doubt arises. That's why you have to not just read the suttas but experience what the suttas are talking about.

MN 38:

"Yes, venerable sir." - "Monks, does doubt arise when one is uncertain thus: 'With the cessation of that nutriment, is what has come to be subject to cessation?'"

BV: Yes, of course. If you haven't really seen it you don't know. You have doubt.

MN 38:

11. "Monks, is doubt abandoned in one who sees as it actually is with proper wisdom thus: 'This has come to be'" - "Yes, venerable sir." -

"Monks, is doubt abandoned in one who sees as it actually is with proper wisdom thus: 'Its origination occurs with that as nutriment?'" - "Yes, venerable sir." - "Monks, is doubt abandoned in one who sees as it actually is with proper wisdom thus: 'With the cessation of that nutriment, what has come to be is subject to cessation?'"

BV: Of course. When you actually see it how can there be any doubt? That's the Buddhist faith, but it's also confidence. You know for yourself and no amount of somebody else trying to convince you otherwise is going to convince you because you already know and see.

MN 38:

12. "Monks, are you thus free from doubt here: 'This has come to be?'" - "Yes, venerable sir." - "Monks, are you thus free from doubt here: 'Its origination occurs with that as nutriment?'" - "Yes, venerable sir." - "Monks, are you thus free from doubt here: 'With the cessation of that nutriment, what has come to be is subject to cessation?'" - "Yes, venerable sir."

{35:07}

BV: That made the Buddha happy because they were practicing monks.

MN 38:

13. "Monks, has it been seen well by you as it actually is with proper wisdom thus: 'This has come to be?'" - "Yes, venerable sir." - "Monks, has it been seen well by you as it actually is with proper wisdom; 'Its origination occurs with that as nutriment?'" - "Yes, venerable sir." - "Monks, has it been seen well by you as it actually is with proper wisdom thus: 'With the cessation of that nutriment, what has come to be is subject to cessation?'" - "Yes, venerable sir."

14. "Monks, purified and bright as this view is, if you adhere to it, cherish it, treasure it, and treat it as a possession, would you then understand that the Dhamma has been taught as similar to a raft, being for the purpose of crossing over, not for the purpose of

grasping?" - "No...

BV: Why? Because even though this is a very purified and right view you're still grabbing onto it; you're taking it personally. You're not seeing its absolute true nature.

MN 38:

"Monks, purified and bright as this view is, if you do not adhere to it, cherish it, treasure it, and treat it as a possession, would you then understand that the Dhamma has been taught as similar to a raft, being for the purpose of crossing over, not for the purpose of grasping?" - "Yes, venerable sir."

(Nutriment and Dependent Origination)

15. "Monks, there are these four kinds of nutriment for the maintenance of beings that already have come to be and for the support of those seeking new existence. What four? They are: physical food as nutriment, gross or subtle; contact as the second; mental volition as the third; and consciousness as the fourth.

16. "Now, monks, these four kinds of nutriment have what as their source, what as their origin, from what are they born and produced? These four kinds of nutriment have craving as their source, craving as their origin; they are born and produced from craving. And this craving has what as its source? Craving has feeling as its source. And this feeling has what as its source? Feeling has contact as its source. And this contact has what as its source? Contact has the six-fold base as its source. And this six-fold base has what as its source? The six-fold base has mentality/materiality as its source. And this mentality/materiality has what as its source? Mentality/materiality has consciousness as its source. And this consciousness has what as its source? Consciousness has formations as its source. And these formations have what as their source, what as their origin; from what are they born and produced? Formations have ignorance as their source, ignorance as their origin; they are born and produced from

ignorance.

{39:56}

BV: What is ignorance?

ST: ~~

BV: Well, that's part of it. It's the big four

ST: Ahhhh...

BV: The Four Noble Truths. Now, this is interesting because...

ST: Ignorance is the Four Noble Truths?

BV: Ignorance is not knowing the Four Noble Truths...not seeing the Four Noble Truths. And, the second Noble Truth is craving. The cause of suffering is craving. So, it gets intertwined with ignorance; craving and ignorance, ignorance and craving. They're mixed up together.

MN 38:

(Forward Exposition on Arising)

17. "So, monks, with ignorance as condition, formations come to be; with formations as condition, consciousness comes to be; with consciousness as condition, mentality/materiality come to be; with mentality/materiality as condition, the six-fold base comes to be; with the six-fold base as condition, contact comes to be; with contact as condition, feeling comes to be; with feeling as condition, craving comes to be; with craving as condition, clinging comes to be; with clinging as condition, being comes to be;

BV: Now, this is also translated as "Existence". I had a long talk with U Silananda about this at one point and I kept saying that it's Being, it's Existence, but it's also your habitual tendencies and he was agreeing with that.

{42:24}

MN 38:

with being as condition, birth comes to be; with birth as condition, aging and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair comes to be. Such is this origin of the whole mass of suffering.

(Reverse Order Questionnaire on Arising)

18. ""With birth as condition, aging and death.': so it was said. Now, monks, do aging and death have birth as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"Aging and death have birth as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With birth as condition, aging and death.'"

""With being as condition, birth.': so it was said. Now, monks, does birth have being as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"Birth has being as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case; 'With being as condition, birth.'"

""With clinging as condition, being.': so it was said. Now, monks, does being have clinging as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"Being has clinging as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With clinging as condition, being.'"

""With craving as condition, clinging.!: so it was said. Now, monks, does clinging have craving as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"Clinging has craving as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With craving as condition, clinging.'"

“With feeling as condition, craving.’: so it was said. Now, monks, does craving have feeling as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?”

“Craving has feeling as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: ‘With feeling as condition, craving.’”

“With contact as condition, feeling.’: so it was said. Now, monks, does feeling have contact as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?”

“Feeling has contact as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: ‘With contact as condition, feeling.’”

{46:04}

ST: So, feeling is positive, negative, or neutral?

BV: Pleasant, painful, or neutral.

ST: Pleasant, painful, or neutral.

BV: Yeah, you can’t really put it in terms of positive and negative, because it’s not either one of those. Although, when you get into your clinging it sure pops up that way! [laughs] That’s the nature of clinging to take you further away from the actual experience. This is a pleasant feeling, this is a painful feeling, this is neither painful nor pleasant. When you get to clinging there’s all the reasons why it turns positive or negative, but these are all concepts.

[repeats] [“Feeling has contact as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: ‘With contact as condition, feeling.’ ”]

MN 38:

“With the six-fold base as condition, contact.’: so it was said. Now, monks, does contact have the six-fold base as condition or not, or

how do you take it in this case?"

"Contact has the six-fold base as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With the six-fold base as condition, contact.'"

"'With the mentality/materiality as condition, the six-fold base.': so it was said. Now, monks, does the six-fold base have mentality/materiality as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"The six-fold base has mentality/materiality as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With mentality/materiality as condition, the six-fold base.'"

"'With consciousness as condition, mentality/materiality.': so it was said. Now, monks, does mentality/materiality have consciousness as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"Mentality/materiality has consciousness as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With consciousness as condition, mentality/materiality.'"

"'With formations as condition, consciousness.': so it was said. Now, monks, does consciousness have formations as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"Consciousness has formations as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With formations as condition, consciousness.'"

"'With ignorance as condition, formations.': so it was said. Now, monks, do formations have ignorance as condition or not, or how do you take it in this case?"

"Formations have ignorance as condition, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: 'With ignorance as condition, formations.'"

{49:51}

BV: Now, I'm going to go to another book and this is going to explain the Analysis of Dependent Origination. This is from the Samyutta Nikāya. (Page 534)

Samyutta Nikāya - Part II: The Book of Causation (Nidānavagga) – Chapter I – 12 Nidānasamyutta – Connected Discourses on Causation – 2 (2) Analysis of Dependent Origination

SN 12:2:

“And what, monks, is aging-and-death? The aging of the various beings in the various orders of beings, their growing old, brokenness of teeth, greyness of hair, wrinkling of skin, decline of vitality, degeneration of the faculties: this is called aging. The passing away of the various beings from the various orders of beings, their perishing, breakup, disappearance, mortality, death, completion of time, the breakup of the aggregates, the laying down of the carcass: this is called death. This is aging and this death are together called aging-and-death.

“And what monks, is birth? Birth of the various beings into the various order of beings, their being born, descent into the womb, production, the manifestation of the aggregates,

BV: Manifestation of the aggregates, with the death, it's calling the...the breakup of the aggregates. That is continually happening. The aggregates arise, they pass away; birth, death, birth, death. It's birth and death of the aggregates.

ST: ~~

BV: Body, Feeling, Perception, Volition, Consciousness. And they're continually arising and passing away; birth, death, birth death, birth, death.

SN 12:2:

the obtaining of the sense bases. This is called birth.

“And what, monks, is existence [being]?”

There are these three kinds of existence: sense-sphere existence,

BV: That means material plane existence

SN 12:2:

form-sphere existence,

BV: Subtle body existence; devas, some of the lower brahmas. And...

SN 12:2:

formless-sphere existence

BV: Arupa jhāna, brahmas.

SN 12:2:

...this is called existence.

“And what, monks, is clinging? There are these four kinds of clinging: clinging to sensual pleasures, clinging to views,

BV: Opinions, concepts, all of that sort of thing.

SN 12:2:

...clinging to rules and vows, clinging to a doctrine of the self.

BV: So, the two biggest...really the biggest clingings are clinging to your views and the doctrine of the self. That's the one that...they're the hardest to let go of. You can recognize the clinging to sensual pleasures and you can actually let that go a lot easier than the other kind of clinging. But the clinging that rites and rituals will lead you to Nibbana, a lot of people have that belief. Some Mahayanas, they believe that if you say, “Amitābha, Amitābha, Amitābha, Amitābha,” that if you say it all the time you will be...you will attain Nibbana. Now, that's a wrong belief. And, there's people that will even believe

that if you say, "Buddha Dhamma Sangha, Buddha Dhamma Sangha," all the time that you will attain Nibbana. There is advantage to doing that but it will not lead you to Nibbana.

So, you have to pick and choose your times to use that.

{54:55}

SN 12:2:

"And what is craving? There are these six classes of craving: craving for forms, craving for sounds, craving for odors, craving for taste, craving for tactile objects, craving for mental phenomena.

BV: How does craving manifest? How does craving manifest?

ST: Tightness in the mind?

BV: Tight...tight in the mind and body, and that is the "I Like It...I Don't Like It" mind; that tightness, that craving, that holding on, the beginning of the process.

SN 12:2:

"What, monks, is feeling? There are these six classes of feeling: feeling born of eye contact, feeling born of ear contact, feeling born of nose contact, feeling born of tongue contact, feeling born of body contact, feeling born of mind contact. This is called feeling.

"And what, monks, is contact? There are these six classes of contact: eye contact, ear contact, nose contact, tongue contact, body contact, and mind contact. These are called contact.

"And what, monks, are the six sense bases? The eye base, the ear base, the nose base, the tongue base, the body base, the mind base. These are called the six sense bases.

"And what, monks, is mentality and materiality? Feeling, perception, volition, contact, attention: this is called mentality.

BV: We'll do that again.

[repeats] [Feeling, perception, volition, contact, attention: this is called mentality.]

SN 12:2:

The four great elements and the form derived from the four great elements: this is called materiality. Thus this mentality and this materiality are together called mentality/materiality.

BV: How can it be that feeling is part of mentality? Is it really part of mentality?

ST: ~

BV: Why?

ST: ~~

BV: It's not one of the four great elements.

ST: Right. ~~

BV: She got it faster than you did. [laughs]

This is one of the major insights that the Buddha had was mentality and materiality, and they are intertwined. When you practice your Brahmanism and any other form of meditation that has one-pointed concentration, you lose body...don't even know that it's there. But, until you get up to a realm of neither perception nor non-perception if there is contact there is body. And, contact is known because the five aggregates are still seeable all the way up into the realm of nothingness. The five aggregates are there.

ST: In the realm of nothingness...

BV: In the realm of nothingness, also. Although, when you're sitting you don't necessarily feel your body. But, if there is contact you will feel that contact. It doesn't necessarily make your mind shake at all.

ST: And all the six sense doors are still there...

BV: They are still there. That is why you can do your walking meditation and you might not feel the rest of your body, but you'll feel the contact of the feet touching the ground.

ST: ~~

BV: And this is a real point of contention for a lot of Theravadins that are into Buddhaghosa. They think it's really absurd that anybody could walk around in a jhāna because there's that separation of mind and body. Anyway...

{1:00:57}

SN 12:2:

"And what, monks, is consciousness? There are these six classes of consciousness:

BV: Any idea what they might be?

SN 12:2:

Eye consciousness, ear consciousness, nose consciousness, tongue consciousness, body consciousness, and mind consciousness.

BV: Very good!

SN 12:2:

"And what are the volitional formations? There are these three kinds of volitional formations: the body volitional formation, the verbal volitional formation, and the mental volitional formation. These are called the formations.

"And, monks, what is ignorance? Not knowing suffering, not knowing the origin of suffering, not knowing the cessation of suffering, not knowing the way leading to the cessation of suffering. This is called ignorance.

BV: So, now you know exactly what Dependent Origination is. You've got the definition.

Returns to reading MN:38.

MN 38:

(Recapitulation on Arising)

19. "Good, monks. So you say thus, and I also say thus: 'When this exists, that comes to be; with the arising of this, that arises.' That is, with ignorance as condition, formations come to be; with formations as condition, consciousness comes to be; with consciousness as condition, mentality/materiality come to be; with mentality/materiality as condition, the six sense base comes to be; with the six sense base as condition, contact comes to be; with contact as condition, feeling comes to be; with feeling as condition, craving comes to be; with craving as condition, clinging comes to be; with clinging as condition, being comes to be; with being as condition, birth comes to be; with birth as condition, aging and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair come to be. Such is the origin of this whole mass of suffering.

(The Forward Exposition On The Cessation)

20. "But with the remainderless fading away and cessation of ignorance comes cessation of formations; with the cessation of formations, cessation of consciousness; with the cessation of consciousness, cessation of mentality/materiality; with the cessation of mentality/materiality, cessation of the six sense base; with the cessation of the six sense base, cessation of contact; with the cessation of contact, comes the cessation of feeling; with the cessation of feeling, cessation of craving; with the cessation of craving comes the cessation of clinging; with the cessation of clinging, cessation of being; with the cessation of being, cessation of birth; with the cessation of birth, aging and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair cease. Such is the cessation of

this whole mass of suffering.”

{1:05:57}

(The Reverse Order Questionnaire on Cessation)

21. ““With the cessation of birth, cessation of aging and death’: so it was said. Now, monks, do aging and death cease with the cessation of birth and death or not, or how do you take it in this case?”

“Aging and death cease with the cessation of birth, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: ‘With the cessation of birth, cessation of aging and death.’”

““With the cessation of being, cessation of birth’

““With the cessation of clinging, the cessation of being’

““With the cessation of craving, the cessation of clinging’

““With the cessation of feeling, the cessation of craving’

““With the cessation of contact, cessation of feeling’

““With the cessation of the six-fold sense base, cessation of contact’

““With the cessation of the mentality/materiality, cessation of the six-fold base’

““With the cessation of consciousness, cessation of mentality/materiality’

““With the cessation of formations, cessation of consciousness’

““With the cessation of ignorance, cessation of formations’: so it was said. Now, monks, do formations cease with the cessation of ignorance or not, or how do you take it in this case?”

“Formations cease with the cessation of ignorance, venerable sir. Thus we take it in this case: ‘With the cessation of ignorance, cessation of formations.’”

(Recapitulation on Cessation)

22. “Good, monks. So you say thus, and I also say thus: ‘When this does not exist, that does not come to be; with the cessation of this, that ceases.’”

BV: This is the correct way of teaching it; teaching the cessation. That’s why venerable Sāriputta in sutta number ten, he teaches the cessation of...excuse me...sutta number nine, he teaches the Dependent Origination starting at aging and death and going back down to ignorance.

Okay.

MN 38:

That is, with the cessation of ignorance comes the cessation of formations; with the cessation of formations, cessation of consciousness; with the cessation of consciousness, the cessation of mentality/materiality; with the cessation of mentality/materiality, cessation of the six-fold base; with the cessation of the six-fold base, cessation of contact; with the cessation of contact, cessation of feeling; with the cessation of feeling, cessation of craving; with the cessation of craving, cessation of clinging; with the cessation of clinging, cessation of being; with the cessation of being, cessation of birth; with the cessation of birth, aging and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and despair cease. Such is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering.

BV: Now, we get into personal knowledge.

{1:10:06}

MN 38:

(Personal Knowledge)

23. "Monks, knowing and seeing in this way, would you run back to the past thus: 'Were we in the past? Were we not in the past? What were we in the past? How were we in the past? Having been what, what did we become in the past?'" - "No venerable sir."

"Knowing and seeing in this way, would you run forward to the future thus: 'Shall we be in the future? Shall we not be in the future? What shall we be in the future? How shall we be in the future?'" - "No, venerable sir."

"Knowing and seeing in this way, would you now be inwardly perplexed about the present thus: 'Am I? Am I not? What am I? How am I? Where has this being come from? Where will it go?'"

BV: There would not be any question at all. When you see the impersonal nature of Dependent Origination there's no going to the past, there's no going to the future, there's only seeing what there is right now and it is impersonal.

MN 38:

24. "Monks, knowing and seeing in this way, would you speak thus: 'The Teacher is respected by us. We speak as we do out of respect for the Teacher?'"

BV: Would you say that?

MN 38:

"No, venerable sir."

BV: Why? Because they saw it themselves.

MN 38:

"Knowing and seeing in this way, would you speak thus: 'The Recluse says this, and we speak thus at the bidding of the Recluse?'" - "No, venerable sir." - "Knowing and seeing in this way, would you acknowledge another teacher?"

BV: You're your own teacher.

MN 38:

"No, venerable sir." - "Knowing and seeing in this way, would you return to the observances, tumultuous debates, and auspicious signs of ordinary recluses and brahmins, taking them as the core of the holy life?"

BV: Not a chance.

MN 38:

"No, venerable sir." - "Do you speak only of what you have known, seen, and understood for yourselves?"

BV: You bet!

MN 38:

"Yes, venerable sir."

25. "Good, monks. So you have been guided by me with this Dhamma, which is visible here and now, immediately effective, inviting inspection, onward leading, to be experienced by the wise for themselves. For it was with reference to this that it has been said: 'Monks, this Dhamma is visible here and now and immediately effective, inviting inspection, onward leading, to be experienced by the wise for themselves.'

(The Round of Existence: Conception to Maturity)

26. "Monks, the descent of the embryo takes place through the union of three things. Here, there is the union of the mother and the father, but the mother is not in season, and the coming being is not present - in that case no descent of an embryo takes place. Here, there is the union of the mother and father, and the mother is in season, but the coming being is not present - in this case too no descent of the embryo takes place. But when there is the union of the mother and father, and the mother is in season, and the coming

being is present, through the union of these three things the descent of the embryo takes place.

27. "The mother then carries the embryo in her womb for nine or ten months with much anxiety, as a heavy burden. Then, at the end of nine or ten months, the mother gives birth with much anxiety, as a heavy burden. Then when the child is born, she nourishes it with her own blood; for the mother's breast-milk is called blood in the Noble One's Discipline.

28. "When he grows up and his faculties mature, the child plays at such games as play ploughs, tipcat

{1:15:38}

BV: What is tipcat? Do you know how to play tipcat?

Dog: Flapping.

B. Jatikabhivamsa: ~~ palm leaf.

BV: You have a palm leaf...

BJ: Yes, palm leaf ~~ winds blowing it ~~

BV: Oh, a windmill! A tipcat is a windmill. Okay.

{1:16:12}

MN 38:  
somersaults, toy windmills, toy measures, toy cars, and a toy bows and arrow.

ST: Toy cars?

BV: Cars. C...A...R...S. This is the modern version.

MN 38:

29. "When he grows up and his faculties mature still further

BV: Somebody was reading me...in the Vedas, and they started talking about the machine guns. I wanted to know what the Sanskrit word for "machine gun" was. [laughs] What's the Pali word for "car, automobile"?

BJ: ~~

BV: Really?

BJ: Yes. ~~ means...

BV: Going? Moving?

BJ: ~~ means ~~ moving.

BV: Moving.

BJ: ~~ means... ~~

BV: I'll be darned.

BJ: ~~~ engine. ~~

BV: Yeah.

ST: ~~

BV: Some kinds, sure. They had...

ST: They had windmills in Vedas.

BV: Yeah, and pulleys and all of that sort of thing. They could devise some machines.

[Repeats] [29. "When he grows up and his faculties mature still further]

MN 38:

the youth enjoys himself provided and endowed with the five cords of sensual pleasures, with forms cognizable by the eye, with sounds cognizable by the ear, odors cognizable by the nose, flavors cognizable by the tongue, tangibles cognizable by the body that are wished for, desired, agreeable, and likeable, connected with sensual desire, and provocative of lust.

(The Continuation of the Round)

30. "On seeing a form with the eye, he lusts after it if it is pleasurable; dislikes it if it is unpleasing. He abides with mindfulness of the body unestablished, with a limited mind, he does not understand as it actually is the deliverance of mind and deliverance by wisdom wherein those evil unwholesome states cease without remainder. Engaged as he is in favoring and opposing, whatever feeling he feels - whether pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant - he delights in that feeling, welcomes it, and remains holding to it. As he does so, delight arises in him. Now delight in feelings is clinging. With this clinging as condition, being comes to be;

BV: Your habitual tendencies.

{1:19:42}

MN 38:

with being as condition, birth; with birth as condition aging, death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief, and despair come to be. Such is the origin of this whole mass of suffering.

"On hearing a sound with the ear...

"On smelling an odor with the nose...

"On tasting a flavor with the tongue...

“On touching a tangible with the body...

“On cognizing a mind object with mind, he lusts after it if it is pleasing; he dislikes it if it is unpleasing. Now delight in feelings is clinging. With this clinging as condition, being comes to be; with being as condition, birth; with birth as condition aging and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief, and despair come to be. Such is the origin of this whole mass of suffering.

(The Ending of the Round: The Gradual Training)

31. “Here, monks, a Tathāgata appears in the world, accomplished, fully enlightened, perfect in true knowledge and conduct, sublime, knower of the worlds, incomparable leader of persons to be tamed, teacher of gods and humans, enlightened,

BV: There’s a meditation in Thailand called the Buddho meditation. Buddho means “enlightenment”. So, what they’re doing is they’re saying “enlightenment” over and over and over. And they do “Bu” on the in breath, “dho” on the out breath. “Bu” on the in breath. En-light-en-ment. En-light-en-ment. En-light-en-ment. En-light-en-ment. That’s what you call wishful thinking. [laughs]

Ahh...

MN 38:

He declares this world with its gods, its Maras, and its Brahmas, this generation with its recluses and brahmins, its princes and its people, which he has himself realized with direct knowledge. He teaches the Dhamma good in the beginning, good in the middle, good in the end, with the right meaning and phrasing, and he reveals a holy life that is utterly pure and perfect.

32. “A householder or householder's son or one born in some other clan hears that Dhamma. On hearing the Dhamma he acquires faith in the Tathāgata. Possessing that faith, he considers thus: ‘Household life is crowded and dusty; life gone forth is wide open. It is not easy, while living in a home, to lead the holy life utterly perfect and pure as

a polished shell. Suppose I shave off my hair and beard, put on the yellow robe, and go forth from the home life into the homeless.' On a later occasion, abandoning a small or a large fortune, abandoning a small or a large circle of relatives, he shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the yellow robe, and goes forth from the home life into the homeless.

33. "Having thus gone forth, possessing the monk's training and way of life, abandoning the killing of living beings, he abstains from killing living beings; with rod and weapon laid aside, gentle and kindly, he abides compassionate to all living beings. Abandoning the taking of what is not given, he abstains from taking what is not given, taking only what is given, expecting only what is given, by not stealing he abides in purity. Abandoning incelibacy, he observes celibacy, living apart, abstaining from the vulgar practice of sexual intercourse.

"Abandoning false speech, he abstains from false speech; he speaks truth, adheres to truth, is trustworthy and reliable, one who is no deceiver of the world. Abandoning malicious speech, he abstains from malicious speech; he does not repeat elsewhere what was heard here in order to divide those people from these, nor does he repeat to these people what is heard elsewhere in order to divide these people from those; thus he is one who reunites those who are divided, a promoter of friendship, who enjoys concord, and rejoices in concord, delights in concord, a speaker of words that promote concord. Abandoning harsh speech, he abstains from harsh speech.

[Tape ends]

May suffering ones, be suffering free  
And the fear struck, fearless be  
May the grieving shed all grief  
And may all beings find relief.

May all beings share this merit that we have thus acquired

For the acquisition of all kinds of happiness.

May beings inhabiting space and earth  
Devas and nagas of mighty power  
Share this merit of ours.

May they long protect the Buddha's dispensation.  
Sadhu . . . Sadhu . . . Sadhu . . .

Sutta translation (C) Bhikkhu Bodhi 1995, 2001. Reprinted from The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha: A Translation of the Majjhima Nikaya with permission of Wisdom Publications, 199 Elm Street, Somerville, MA 02144 U.S.A. [www.wisdompubs.org](http://www.wisdompubs.org)

Sutta translations (C) Bhikkhu Bodhi 2000. Reprinted from The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: A Translation of the Samyutta Nikaya with permission of Wisdom Publications, 199 Elm Street, Somerville, MA 02144 U.S.A, [www.wisdompubs.org](http://www.wisdompubs.org)

Transcribed Brent Hagwood 07-Apr-11